Scientific expertise in support of public policies in France

Réunion AVRIST – 8 décembre 2010

Claire Sabbagh INRA - Délégation à l'expertise, à la prospective et aux études

Scientific expertise and public decision making A paradoxical situation

- A persistant distrust in expertise in the public opinion
- A growing need for scientific expertise

Climate Change assessment assessed...



We are all experts!



The expertise resources

National house public expertise Level of ministries Level of ministries Level of ministries Level of government (premier ministre) National external public expertise Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies CNRS, INSERM, INRA, IRD, ADEME, OSEO, CNES Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut Français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Local authorities Regional advisory councils (universities)		
ad hoc committees Boards (HCB, HCSP) Level of government (premier ministre) National external public expertise Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales ((FRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	National house public expertise	Comités consultatifs
Level of government (premier ministre) National external public expertise Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Level of ministries	Inspection générale
National external public expertise Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut Français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)		ad hoc committees
National external public expertise Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales ((FRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)		Boards (HCB, HCSP)
Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Level of government (premier ministre)	Haut Conseil de la science et de la technologie
Institut de France (académies) Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)		
Research organizations and research agencies Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	National external public expertise	
Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Institut de France (académies)	
Universities Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut Français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Research organizations and research agencies	
Security agencies (health and environnment) ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)		CNRS, INSERM, INRA, IRD, ADEME, OSEO, CNES
ANSES National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales ((IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Universities	
National external expertise public/private Fondations Think tanks Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Security agencies (health and environnment)	
Fondations Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)		ANSES
Think tanks Institut français des relations internationales (IFRI), Institut Montaigne FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	National external expertise public/private	
(IFRI), Institut Montaigne NGO s Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Fondations	Institut Pasteur, Institut Curie
NGO s FNE Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	Think tanks	Institut français des relations internationales
Private advice offices Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)		(IFRI), Institut Montaigne
Régional public expertise Regional advisory councils (universities)	NGO s	FNE
	Private advice offices	
Local authorities	Régional public expertise	Regional advisory councils (universities)
	Local authorities	

Scientific expertise How to handle it?

- A great diversity of situations, practices, formats...
- An uneasy access to expertise
- A lack of definition of what expertise is

An societal framework boosting the evolution of expertise practices

- The involvment of civil society
- The implementation of a normative framework

Normative framework

The right to information and public participation in environmental projects (Law Barnier, 1995),

White Paper on European governance on the involvement of civil society in decision-making process (European Commission) (2001)
AFSSA, INVs (1998), AFSSE (law 2001)

Implementation of the National Public Debate (2002)

Standard AFNOR (NF X 50110) (May 2003)

The Environmental Charter, which includes the precautionary principle is incorporated into the preamble of the Constitution (2005),

Parliament report on the scientific expertise (OPECST, 2005)

Law of research (2006) adds scientific expertise in the public interest mission

Grenelle de l'environnement. Debates with politics, stake-holders, professionals, NGOs on variouns topics: pesticides, biodiversity, research,

National Charter of scientific expertise (2010)

Laws Grenelle I et II: national commitment for environnment and sustainable developpment (2009 , 2010)

Scientific expertise Key achievements

- Separation between risk assessment and risk management
- Link between expertise and public debate
- Need for a common standard of expertise

« Experts opinions must be clear for the non-specialized reader » Governance white paper, EC, 2001



Rebuilding the expertise process

- Expertise, a mission for public research
- A national charter of expertise
- Controversy, a core issue
- A culture of expertise to be shared by policies, experts and society

Experts at work Consensus is always a risk!



Controversy, a core issue

- Social controversy, cognitive controversy
- How to sort out the scientific controversies?
- Multidisciplinary approach
- Plurality of points of views

Conclusion

- Building up expertise process : work in progress
- The need for benchmarking the practices
- A European network for providing scientific expertise?

Thank you!

